Common Core Standards and ACT

Protocol for Analysis

of

Argument Writing

Grades Six to Twelve

Macomb Intermediate School District

Macomb Intermediate School District

Example 1

Example 2

Example 3

Example 4

Example 4

Example 5

Example 6

Example 7

Example 7

Example 7

Example 7

Example 7

Example 8

Exam

Write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence. Common Core Argument Writing Protocol

<b>Develop</b> claim(s) and counterclaims fairly, supplying evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both.		
Conform to the conventions of standard written English.	Transitions Use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.	
Conclusion  Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the information or explanation presented.	Oreate an organization that establishes clear relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.	
Formal Style. Establish and maintain a formal style.	Introduce precise claim(s) and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims.	



Macomb Intermediate School District

Clinton Township, MI 48038 44001 Garfield Road tən.bsim.www

# **Argument Writing**

Arguments are used for many purposes—

- to change the reader's point of view,
- to bring about some action on the reader's part, or
- to ask the reader to accept the writer's explanation or evaluation of a concept, issue, or problem.

An argument is a reasoned, logical way of demonstrating that the writer's position, belief, or conclusion is valid. In English language arts, students make claims about the worth or meaning of a literary work or works. They defend their interpretations or judgments with evidence from the text(s) they are writing about. In history/social studies, students analyze evidence from multiple primary and secondary sources to advance a claim that is best supported by the evidence, and they argue for a historically or empirically situated interpretation. In science, students make claims in the form of statements or conclusions that answer questions or address problems. Using data in a scientifically acceptable form, students marshal evidence and draw on their understanding of scientific concepts to argue in support of their claims.

### **Evidence**

One has to back up a claim with evidence – facts, figures, details, quotations, or other sources of data and information that provide support for claims. The strength of your evidence, and your use of it, can make or break your argument. You already have the natural inclination for this type of thinking, if not in an academic setting. Think about how you talked your parents into letting you borrow the family car. Did you present them with lots of instances of your past trustworthiness? Did you make them feel guilty because your friends' parents all let them drive? Did you whine until they just wanted you to shut up? Did you look up statistics on teen driving and use them to show how you didn't fit the dangerous-driver profile?

## Counterargument

One way to strengthen an argument and show that you have a deep understanding of the issue you are discussing is to anticipate and address counterarguments or objections. By considering what someone who disagrees with your position might have to say about your argument, you show that you have thought things through, and you dispose of some of the reasons your audience might have for not accepting your argument. Introduce the counterclaim with a phrase like *One might object here that...* or *It might seem that...* or *It's true that...* or *Admittedly,...* or *Of course,...* or with an anticipated challenging question: *But how...?* or *But why...?* or *But isn't this just...?* or *But if this is so, what about...?* Then you state the case against yourself as briefly but as clearly and forcefully as you can, pointing to evidence where possible.

#### Rebuttal

Rebut/reject the counterargument and explain why it is mistaken. Return to your own argument—which you announce with a *but*, *yet*, *however*, *nevertheless or still*—must likewise involve careful reasoning, not a flippant (or nervous) dismissal. In reasoning about the proposed counter-argument, you may refute it, showing why it is mistaken or acknowledge its validity or plausibility, but suggest why on balance it's relatively less important or less likely than what you propose, and thus the counterargument doesn't overturn your argument.

**Development: Claim, Evidence, Counterclaim, Rebuttal** 

# **Development**

### 6th, 7th and 8th Grades

Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant evidence, using accurate, credible sources and demonstrating an understanding of the topic or text.

#### 9th/10th Grades

Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly, supplying evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level and concerns.

#### 11<sup>th</sup> /12<sup>th</sup> Grades

Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly and thoroughly, supplying the most relevant evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level, concerns, values, and possible biases.

Common Core Standards

# Making a Claim

An argument is usually a main idea, often called a "claim" or "thesis statement," backed up with evidence that supports the idea. Claims can be as simple as "Protons are positively charged and electrons are negatively charged," with evidence such as, "In this experiment, protons and electrons acted in such and such a way." Claims can also be as complex as "The end of the South African system of apartheid was inevitable," using reasoning and evidence such as, "Every successful revolution in the modern era has come about after the government in power has given and then removed small concessions to the uprising group."

The Standards place special emphasis on writing logical arguments as a particularly important form of collegeand career-ready writing. When writing to persuade, writers employ a variety of persuasive strategies. One common strategy is an appeal to the credibility, character, or authority of the writer (or speaker). When writers establish that they are knowledgeable and trustworthy, audiences are more likely to believe what they say. Another is an appeal to the audience's self-interest, sense of identity, or emotions, any of which can sway an audience. A logical argument, on the other hand, convinces the audience because of the perceived merit and reasonableness of the claims and proofs offered rather than either the emotions the writing evokes in the audience or the writer's character or credentials.

Common Core Standards, Appendix A

#### The Protocol

This protocol focuses on the key elements of writing arguments: Introduction (claim), Organization, Development (evidence, counterclaim, rebuttal), Transitions, Formal Style, Conclusion and Conventions of Standard English. The analysis uses non-judgmental language and specific examples. The Common Core Standards provide guidance for the kind and range of writing expected in each of the genres.

**Definitions** Protocol

# **Formal Style**

## 6th, 7th and 8th Grades

Establish and maintain a formal style.

#### 9th- 12th Grades

Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which they are writing.

Common Core Standards

Formal Informal

Avoid using colloquial words/expressions. (substitute with children, man/boy, wonderful, many, etc.)	May use colloquial words/expressions. (kids, awesome, a lot, etc.)
Avoid contractions. (write out full words: cannot, will not)	May use contractions. (can't, won't, shouldn't, etc.).
Write in third person. (except in business letters where first person may be used).	May use first, second, or third person.
Avoid addressing readers using second person pronouns. (use one, one's, the reader, the reader's, etc.)	May address readers using second person pronouns. (you, your, etc.)
Avoid using abbreviated words. (use full versions - like photograph, television, etc.)	May use abbreviated words. (photo, TV, etc.)
Longer and more complex sentences are preferred. (short simple sentences reflects poorly on the writer.	May use short and simple sentences.

http://ezinearticles.com/?The-Difference-Between-Formal-and-Informal-Writing&id=594208

# **Conclusions**

### Grades 6th-12th

Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the argument presented.

**Common Core Standards** 

### A conclusion should...

- Stress the importance of the thesis or claim
- Give the argument a sense of completeness
- Leave a final impression on the reader
- Include the strongest evidence
- Synthesize, not summarize
- Redirect your readers
- Create a new meaning
- Echo the introduction
- Challenge the reader

http://leo.stcloudstate.edu/acadwrite/conclude.html

**Introduction** Conclusion

#### Introduction

**6<sup>th</sup> – 8<sup>th</sup> Grade** Introduce claim(s), acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically.

9th—12th Grade Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

Common Core Standards

An introduction is the best chance for a writer to make a good impression on the reader. The introductory paragraph:

- 1. Grabs the reader's attention with one of the following that leads to the writer's point:
  - · A surprising statement/statistic: Because of their confinement many zoo animals develop unnatural habits such as pacing back and forth or swaying.
  - · A direct or rhetorical question: Does a captive animal behave like its counterpart in the wild?
  - · A relevant quote: "The city is not a concrete jungle, it is a human zoo."
  - · Historical background: For hundreds of years, zoos have introduced a wide variety of animals to visitors who otherwise would never have seen them.
  - · An anecdote: One of my favorite pastimes is to visit a zoo, but I wonder....
- **2**. Narrows the subject: *Times change, however, and we must question whether zoos are still relevant in a world where we wish to treat animals humanely.*
- 3. States the thesis, claim, or key point: Zoos treat animals inhumanely. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=clPtbFT23Bs

Thesis statements focus on a single topic, have more than one reasonable answer, convey specific information and reveal the writer's stance or opinion on the subject.

#### **Conventions of Standard English**

#### Language Progressive Skills, by Grade

- **L.3.1f.** Ensure subject-verb and pronoun antecedent agreement.
- **L.3.3a.** Choose words and phrases for effect.
- **L.4.1f.** Produce complete sentences, recognizing and correcting inappropriate fragments and run ons.
- **L.4.1g.** Correctly use frequently confused words (e.g., *to/too/two; there/their*).
- **L.4.3a.** Choose words and phrases to convey ideas precisely.
- **L.4.3b.** Choose punctuation for effect.
- **L.5.1d.** Recognize and correct inappropriate shifts in verb tense.
- **L.5.2a.** Use punctuation to separate items in a series.
- **L.6.1c.** Recognize and correct inappropriate shifts in pronoun number and person.
- **L.6.1d.** Recognize and correct vague pronouns (i.e., ones with unclear or ambiguous antecedents).
- **L.6.1e.** Recognize variations from standard English in their own and others' writing and speaking, and identify and use strategies to improve expression in conventional language.
- **L.6.2a.** Use punctuation (commas, parentheses, dashes) to set off nonrestrictive/parenthetical elements.
- **L.6.3a.** Vary sentence patterns for meaning, reader/listener interest, and style.
- **L.6.3b.** Maintain consistency in style and tone.
- **L.7.1c.** Place phrases and clauses within a sentence, recognizing and correcting misplaced and dangling modifiers.
- **L.7.3a.** Choose language that expresses ideas precisely and concisely, recognizing and eliminating wordiness and redundancy.
- **L.8.1d.** Recognize and correct inappropriate shifts in verb voice and mood.
- **L.9–10.1a**. Use parallel structure

Common Core Standards, Appendix A

Formal Style Conventions

# Organization

### 6<sup>th</sup> Grade

organize the reasons and evidence clearly.

### 7th and 8th Grades

organize the reasons and evidence **logically**.

### 9<sup>th</sup>/10<sup>th</sup> Grades

create an organization that **establishes clear relationships among claims(s), counterclaims**, reasons, and evidence.

#### 11<sup>+</sup>/12<sup>+</sup> Grades

create an organization that **logically sequences** claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

**Common Core Standards** 

# Introduction

Claim/Thesis Broad Context

# Body

Specific evidence Counterclaim Rebuttal

## Conclusion

Full Circle to claim Summary Strongest point

# **Transitions**

"Like a bridge that gets from one place to another "

# 6th, 7th, and 8th Grades

Use appropriate and varied transitions to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among ideas and concepts. **9**th/**10**th **Grades** 

Use appropriate and varied transitions to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts.

### 11th/12th Grades

Use appropriate and varied transitions and **syntax to link the major** sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts. **Common Core Standards** 

Words and phrases that signal evidence:	for example, to illustrate, in this case, specifically, once, for instance, such as, to demonstrate, take the case of
Words and phrases that signal counterclaims:	others would say, it might seem that, however, on the other hand, while, instead, yet, despite, still, nevertheless, even though, in contrast, but
Words and phrases that signal rebuttal:	but, however, in contrast, on the other hand, on the contrary, yet, nevertheless, balanced against, differing from, variation, still, unlike, conversely, otherwise
Words and phrases that signal conclusion:	to summarize, in short, in brief, in sum, in summary, to sum up, in conclusion, to conclude, finally

**Organization** Transitions